The International Judges Sub-committee met at 0900 - 1330 hours at the Melia Palas Atenea Hotel, Palma, Mallorca, Spain on Sunday 2 November 2014

Please refer to the ISAF website www.sailing.org for the details of the submissions on this agenda

1. Opening of the Meeting
2. Minutes of the previous meeting and Agenda
3. IJ Renewal Test
4. IJ Report System
5. IJ Manual
6. IJ Study
7. Rule 42 Working Party
8. Education and Development
9. Event Appointments
10. Strategy and development
11. Race Officials Committee
12. Submissions
13. Closed Session (closed to observers)

Present:
Andres Perez (ESP) – Chairman
A. Lynne Beal – Vice-Chairman
Riccardo Antoni (ITA)
Russell Green (NZL)
Xinzu Gu (CHN)
Gonzalo Heredia (ARG)
Nelson Horn Ilha (BRA)

Ewa Jodlowska (POL)
Elliot Levy (VEN)
Lars Nyqvist (FIN)
Andrus Poksi (EST)
Rut Subniran (THA)
Costas Tsantilis (GRE)
Stephen Wrigley (USA)

Chris Atkins – ISAF Vice-President (in part)
Jon Napier – ISAF Competitions Manager
Madeleine Dunn – ISAF Competitions & Race Officials Administrator

Apologies:
Ronnie McCracken (HKG)

1. Opening of the Meeting
   (a) Welcome by the Chairman
   The Chairman welcomed the Sub-committee to Palma and thanked them for their work during the year.
   The Competitions Manager updated the Sub-committee on Ronnie McCracken’s illness, and the Sub-committee sent its best wishes to Ronnie for a speedy recovery.
   Vice-President Chris Atkins welcomed the Sub-committee. He said he looked forward to the Sub-committee’s discussions on the development of race official practices for ISAF Events to make them better for the sport and the sailors taking part.
   (b) Attendees and Apologies
   Apologies were received from Ronnie McCracken.
   (c) Obituaries
   The Sub-committee paid respects following the deaths of Hugh Elliott (USA), Andre Raoult (COK) and Masayuki Ishii (JPN).
2. Minutes of the previous meeting and Agenda

(a) Minutes
The Sub-committee noted the minutes of the previous International Judges Sub-committee meeting held on 10 November 2013 which were circulated and approved after the meeting.

(b) Matters arising
There were no matters arising from those minutes not already covered by the agenda.

3. IJ Renewal Test

The Chairman thanked the Test Working Group for its hard work in the development and implementation of the Renewal Test in its inaugural year. He thanked Steve Wrigley for leading the Group, Rut Subniran for fielding queries from IJs, Gonzalo Heredia for handling the IT development of the system and Riccardo Antoni for the development of the questions.

Steve Wrigley updated the Sub-committee on the use of Renewal Test this year. 124 International Judges renewing in 2014 were required to take the Test. He reported that the questions used in any particular test are randomly generated from the bank of questions. The master question sheet, any feedback received and the log of changes to questions is circulated regularly around the Working Group for review and any necessary revisions. He reported that there seems to be no relationship between the amount of time a person took to take the test and the mark obtained. Approximately 80 International Judges had taken the test as of the date of the meeting, with a high number of International Judges passing the test.

The Working Group proposed that in 2015 only International Judges who were renewing in 2015 would have access to the renewal test while further improvements are made.

The Competitions Manager reported that, the first full use of the renewal test system had been remarkably smooth with few problems. There had been a few issues with the availability of proctors and the resetting of passwords. Therefore, for any candidate who could not locate a proctor, the Secretariat had agreed alternative arrangements for the supervision of the test.

The Chairman speculated whether the requirement to take the renewal test had affected the renewal rate for International Judges. The best estimate was that 17 International Judges had not renewed due to the requirement to take a test, however there was no way of knowing the real motivation for retiring. The Chairman repeated the Sub-committee’s goal from previous years that the test is designed to maintain standards of competence for International Judges, but not push anyone to retire. He highlighted the high pass rate as an example of this.

With regards to improvements to the system, the Chairman encouraged comments and feedback on the questions. The Working Group will continue work on improvements and upgrades to the system. The Vice-Chairman said an important goal was to maintain the integrity of the on-line test to ensure that the test is accessible as possible.

The Competitions Manager agreed to provide the Working Group with the details of the contract with the e-learning provider currently in use.

Decision
The continued use of the e-learning system for the renewal test in 2015 is approved.
In order to continue the controlled development of the system, in 2015 the renewal test will only be available for International Judges renewing in that year.
4. IJ Report System

(a) IJ Regatta Reports

The Sub-committee received a report from Lars Nyqvist on the IJ regatta reports received in the year.

The Sub-committee was informed that the ijreport.org system had worked well in 2014, with 223 regattas reported by International Judges. The overall number of hearings had decreased and the use of arbitration had increased. Requests for redress had risen in the year, as had requests for OCS redress.

The majority of IJ regatta reports came from Europe and North America, which might not reflecting sailing activity around the world.

There were both positive and negative reports concerning the use of drones to photograph racing. It agreed this was an important activity to monitor for developments and use in race management and hearings.

The Chairman thanked Lars Nyqvist and Costas Tsantilis for their work reviewing the reports received.

**Decision**
International Judges are asked to include a report specifically on any experiences at events involving drones.

(b) IJ Regatta Report System

The Sub-committee received a report from Lars Nyqvist on the IJ regatta report system and a proposal for the development of the online system.

Gonzalo Heredia commented that the work of the Information Technology & Tracking Commission impacted on this area, and that the Commission Chairman was looking at linking the IJ report system with the ISAF central system. The Competitions Manager reported that the main IT priority for the coming year was the online applications system for race officials.

The Sub-committee discussed the usefulness of the reports. The Chairman and the Competitions Manager, as recipients of the “front page” reports, reported they had significant concerns about the quality of the feedback received on the performance of judges as it was almost always consistently in the top category, giving the impression that International Judges are reluctant to report inadequate performance. The Competitions Manager reported that the system can be useful for decisions about event appointments, as it can show ISAF what events officials have been to recently.

**Decision**
The Sub-committee confirmed that the submission of a report was still mandatory for the chairman of an international jury. The Sub-committee recommends to Race Officials Committee the development of the IJ regatta report system in line with the proposal received.

5. IJ Manual

The Sub-committee received a report from Lars Nyqvist on the IJ Manual and discussed updates. In particular, it noted the work undertaken by David Brunskill (GBR) with the Oceanic & Offshore Committee on the section on judging oceanic racing.

**Decision**
The Sub-committee approved the amended section on oceanic judging.
6. **IJ Study**

The Sub-committee received a report from the Chairman on the retention of International Judges. He presented the statistics on annual applications and the age of candidates. The Chairman noted a decrease in the number of applications received and that around 15% of International Judges appear not to have renewed this year.

The average age of International Judges has decreased slightly. Travel grants have enabled some applicants with less financial means to attend events to enable them to qualify as International Judges.

7. **Rule 42 Working Party**

The Sub-committee received a report from Zofia Truchanowicz (POL) as Chairman of the Rule 42 Working Party.

Zofia reported the addition to the Working Party of Lijia Xu (CHN) from the ISAF Athletes’ Commission, whose involvement has been beneficial. Zofia and the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee reported that feedback from the Coaches’ Commission was that rule 42 was being judged correctly at the Olympic level; but that there is inconsistency at lower level and youth competitions.

Zofia reported that, after deliberation, the Working Party recommended not to make any proposal to delete the ooching rule. Their decision is but, to continue to monitor developments. The Working Party also recommended against using the phrase “clearly propel” in the interpretations. They further recommended that each class make a decision whether to permit one pump or one roll at the starting line to start.

The Working Party recommends having better publicity on the common breach documentation on websites for classes and ISAF to promote consistency in making calls.

The Working Party has switched from using the e-learning platform to YouTube for the distribution of content. It will liaise with the ISAF Communications Department over the potential use of the ISAF TV channel on YouTube.

Finally, Zofia notified her intention to step down as the Chairman, but to remain a member of the Working Party. The Working Party recommends that Jacob Mossin Anderson (DEN) is appointed as the Chairman.

**Decision**

The Sub-committee received the Working Party’s report and thanked Zofia for her work as the Chairman. The Sub-committee recommends to the Race Officials Committee that Jacob Mossin Anderson (DEN) be appointed Chairman of the Rule 42 Working Party.

8. **Education and Development**

(a) **Seminars and Clinics**

It was reported that in 2014 IJ Seminars were conducted in San Francisco (USA) and Zagreb (CRO), and a rule 42 clinic was conducted in Palma (ESP). The Sub-committee noted the current applications for seminars in 2015.

(b) **Conferences**

The Sub-committee will plan seminars 2015 from applications, considering areas of need.
9.  **Event Appointments**

   (a) To receive a report from the Event Appointments Working Party.

   The Sub-committee received a report from the Event Appointments Working Party and a verbal update from the Competitions Manager. The Competitions Manager reported that ISAF appointed race officials to 15 events in 2014, dividing appointments among different people to ensure future development of race officials. Following the 2014 ISAF Sailing World Championships in Santander (ESP), the Competitions Manager said there was now concern that the practice of repeatedly appointing the same judges to officiate at Olympic Class world championships has led to inconsistent application of the rules in some areas. The Working Party will review this area when considering appointments.

   There were no other comments on the report.

   (b) To review and comment on the procedures of the Event Appointments Working Party.

   The Sub-committee reviewed the published procedures of the Event Appointments Working Party and had no comments to make.

   (c) To discuss the identification of race officials for development to high level roles at events and to discuss future best practice.

   The Competitions Manager reported that at the ISAF Sailing World Championships in Santander the Jury Chairman and ISAF officials had tested an evaluation procedure for the race officials who served at the event. The goal was to identify those race officials who function at, or have potential to function at ISAF Events and Olympic classes world championships.

10.  **Strategy and development**

   The Sub-committee recommended that International Judges continue to participate in continuing education activities. They recommended that the IJ Continuing Education Library be renamed as such, since its current title, “Other Documents” makes it difficult to find on the ISAF website.

11.  **Race Officials Committee**

   The Sub-committee had no recommendations to make to Race Officials Committee on any areas of its agenda not already considered by the Sub-committee.

12.  **Submissions**

   (a) The Sub-committee considered the following submissions for which the Race Officials Committee is the Reporting Committee:

   i) Submission 109-14 – ISAF Race Officials – New Disciplines, Regulation 6.9.6 from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee

      Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve

      Amend “may” to “shall” in new 31.xx.2

   ii) Submission 110-14 – ISAF Race Officials – Regulation 31 – Race Official Examinations from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee

      Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve
iii) Submission 111-14 – ISAF Race Officials – Regulation 32 – Race Official Performance from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee

Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve

iv) Submission 154-14 – Racing Rules of Sailing – Rule 69 from the Chairmen of the Racing Rules Committee, Constitution Committee and Race Officials Committee

Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Reject

Support the principles.

(b) The Sub-committee considered the following submissions for which the Race Officials Committee is an Other Committee except Racing Rules submissions:

i) Submission 035-13 – Race Officials – Appointments to Events – Regulations 25.8.10, 25.8.13 and 25.8.15 from the Chairman of Constitution Committee

Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve

ii) Submission 001-14 – IFDS Merger with ISAF – New Regulations 5.1(c) and 6.4, Changes to current Regulations and Articles from the Executive Committee

Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Approve

iii) Submission 021-14 – Continental Associations to Train and Certify Regional Technical Officers and Race Officials from the Bulgarian Sailing Federation, Sailing Cook Islands, the Cyprus Sailing Federation, the Fiji Yachting Association, the Hungarian Yachting Association, the Yachting Association of India, the Oman Sailing Committee, the Pakistan Sailing Federation, Papua New Guinea Yacht & Boat Association, Qatar Sailing and Rowing Federation, the Russian Yachting Federation, the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation, the Yachting Association of Sri Lanka, UAE Sailing and Rowing Federation.

Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Reject

It is inappropriate to have a level between international and national technical officials.

iv) Submission 022-14 – Appointment of Technical Delegates and ITOs to Continental Games – Regulation 25.9 from the Bulgarian Sailing Federation, Sailing Cook Islands, the Cyprus Sailing Federation, the Fiji Yachting Association, the Hungarian Yachting Association, the Yachting Association of India, the Oman Sailing Committee, the Pakistan Sailing Federation, Papua New Guinea Yacht & Boat Association, Qatar Sailing and Rowing Federation, the Russian Yachting Federation, the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation, the Yachting Association of Sri Lanka, Swiss Sailing, UAE Sailing and Rowing Federation.

Recommendation to Race Officials Committee: Reject

(c) The Sub-committee considered no Racing Rules submissions for which the Race Officials Committee is an Other Committee.
13. **Closed Session (closed to observers)**

(a) **Performance Investigations**

The Sub-committee received a report on performance investigations from the Competitions Manager.

(b) **Commendations**

The Sub-committee had no commendations to recommend to Race Officials Committee.

(c) **Seminar/Clinic Instructors, Test Administrators and Performance Assessors:**

The Sub-committee noted the current list. The rotation of instructors was discussed.

**Decision**

The Sub-committee will review the current list of instructors in conjunction with the Race Officials Committee with a view to establishing a system of rotation.

(d) **Race Official Appointments**

The Sub-committee considered applications for International Judge status and made recommendations to the Race Officials Committee.